- 1 BY MR. PACE: Q. Do you have that in front of
- 2 you, Mr. Palmer?
- 3 A Excuse me. I didn't hear you.
- 4 Q Schedule 3, Page 3, attached to
- 5 Ameritech Illinois Exhibit 10.2.
- 6 A Yes, I do.
- 7 Q Okay. Now, there you show --
- 8 JUDGE CASEY: I believe that's mismarked. I
- 9 believe it's supposed to be 10.3. The schedule
- 10 itself is mismarked.
- 11 MR. PACE: Okay. Thank you.
- 12 BY MR. PACE: Q. Now, that shows a calculation
- with respect to the one-year life group, correct?
- 14 A That's one of the calculations,
- 15 correct.
- 16 Q Okay. And you show on that Schedule 3
- investment which lists one year as \$4,600; is
- 18 that correct?
- 19 A That's correct.
- 20 Q Now, isn't it true -- isn't it correct
- 21 that Ameritech Illinois actually calculates
- depreciation expense monthly?

- 1 A. I don't know.
- Q. Okay. I am going to hand you a copy of the
- 3 data request and response. It says Data Request
- 4 SDR 001 which I have identified as City Palmer
- 5 Cross Exhibit 20, and specifically to the third
- 6 page of City Palmer Cross Exhibit 20, first of all,
- 7 this is the standard Ameritech Illinois
- 8 Depreciation Expense Report, isn't it?
- 9 A. It appears be a page from a report.
- 10 JUDGE CASEY: From what, Mr. Palmer?
- 11 THE WITNESS: I said it seems to be a page from
- 12 a report.
- I don't know if I agree with the
- 14 characterization that was in the question.
- I would have to have the question.
- 16 BY MR. PACE: Q. Okay. So looking at --
- 17 A. There seems to be other stuff on here.
- 18 JUDGE MORAN: You might ask if you --
- 19 BY MR. PACE: Q. Well, you recognize this as one
- 20 page of Ameritech Illinois Depreciation Expense
- 21 Report?
- 22 MR. ANDERSON: First of all, I am going to

- 1 object to that question.
- 2 I don't know that there has been any
- 3 foundation laid that this is part of a depreciation
- 4 expense report, unquote.
- 5 I think the foundation needs to be laid
- 6 as to whether the witness recognizes this schedule
- 7 or knows what the schedule is or knows what report
- 8 this schedule is from, and that foundation hasn't
- 9 been laid.
- 10 JUDGE MORAN: You do have to lay a foundation.
- 11 BY MR. PACE: Q. You do recognize, Mr. Palmer,
- 12 that this is a data request sent to Ameritech
- 13 Illinois?
- 14 JUDGE MORAN: Is it a staff data request? Is
- 15 that how staff has been --
- 16 MR. HARVEY: I believe that the first group of
- 17 staff data requests sent in -- when was it --
- 18 January of last year did bear that nomenclature.
- 19 Subsequent ones bore the initials of the
- 20 requested party.
- 21 BY MR. PACE: Q. So this is a response to a staff
- 22 data request, is it not, Mr. Palmer?

- 1 A. It appears to be a response to staff data
- 2 request, but the staff data request has items A
- 3 through I on the first page, A through K. And I'm
- 4 trying to figure out which one of these items this
- 5 particular page is responsive to. So maybe you
- 6 could help me out there.
- 7 Q. Okay.
- 8 JUDGE MORAN: Let me ask some questions.
- 9 Mr. Palmer, did you prepare this
- 10 response?
- 11 THE WITNESS: No.
- 12 JUDGE MORAN: Okay. Have you ever seen this
- 13 response prior to it being given to you today?
- 14 THE WITNESS: No, your Honor.
- JUDGE MORAN: Do you know if this is a complete
- 16 response to this -- to a data request?
- 17 THE WITNESS: No. I would have no way of
- 18 knowing.
- 19 BY MR. PACE: Q. But you don't deny that this is
- 20 a --
- 21 MR. ANDERSON: I am --
- 22 BY MR. PACE: Q. -- response --

- 1 MR. ANDERSON: I am going to object to that.
- 2 You are asking him to deny or accept something, and
- 3 he says he doesn't know. So I am going to object.
- 4 MR. PACE: I think --
- 5 JUDGE MORAN: He can only say what it is.
- 6 MR. PACE: Your Honor, I think it's somewhat
- 7 incredible that we have a witness here that is
- 8 attaching schedules to his testimony, trying to
- 9 illustrate the proper depreciation reserve
- 10 calculation and he can't even recognize a
- 11 depreciation page -- depreciation report of the
- 12 company he's at.
- 13 JUDGE MORAN: You can ask him if he relied upon
- 14 that in preparing his testimony, if he's familiar
- 15 with it, if he relied on it.
- 16 BY MR. PACE: Q. Mr. Palmer, do you agree that
- 17 Ameritech Illinois calculates depreciation expense
- 18 monthly?
- 19 MR. ANDERSON: That's been asked and answered.
- 20 BY MR. PACE: Q. What was the answer?
- 21 JUDGE CASEY: I believe he didn't know.
- MR. PACE: I don't believe that was the answer.

- 1 MR. ANDERSON: I believe that was the answer.
- 2 THE WITNESS: You can go back to my answer.
- 3 BY MR. PACE: Q. To save time, you can just repeat
- 4 it.
- 5 Is it correct that Ameritech Illinois
- 6 calculates depreciation expense monthly?
- 7 A. And I said I didn't know because I don't
- 8 know if it's "calculates" or "reports" depreciation
- 9 expense monthly.
- The cost studies I do with respect to
- 11 depreciation and capital costs, they all use
- 12 forwarded -- forward looking total growth reserve
- 13 methodology.
- 14 We don't rely at all on financial
- 15 reports or accounting costs or book costs.
- 16 That's why I am not familiar with this
- 17 particular page of this report or what it purports
- 18 to respond to.
- 19 JUDGE MORAN: Do you even know who prepared this
- 20 particular report?
- 21 THE WITNESS: No, I don't.
- 22 BY MR. PACE: Q. Mr. Palmer, are you a

- 1 depreciation expert?
- 2 A. No. I am not a depreciation engineer at
- 3 all.
- 4 Q. You are not what?
- 5 A. A depreciation engineer.
- 6 Q. Are you a depreciation expert?
- 7 A. No. I wouldn't characterize myself as a
- 8 depreciation expert.
- 9 Q. Have you ever looked at Ameritech Illinois'
- 10 depreciation calculations?
- 11 MR. ANDERSON: I am going to object, beyond the
- 12 scope of the testimony.
- 13 He explained how he develops
- 14 depreciation expense per use in his model.
- 15 Q. I am asking if he relies on depreciation
- 16 calculations of the company. I am asking a
- 17 foundation question for that.
- 18 MR. MUNSON: Then I object that it's vague
- 19 because I don't know what calcu -- what you mean
- 20 by that, calculations of the company.
- 21 BY MR. PACE: Q. Mr. Palmer, can you answer the
- 22 question?

- 1 A. I will go back to my previous answer. The
- 2 way we calculate capital costs and forward looking
- 3 LRSIC studies is called a forecasted growth reserve
- 4 method, and what we do is --
- 5 BY MR. PACE: Q. Mr. Palmer, I have asked you a
- 6 very specific question.
- 7 Have you ever looked at Ameritech
- 8 Illinois' depreciation calculations. I didn't ask
- 9 you what you used. I just asked you that question.
- 10 A. I have looked at them, and I tried to
- 11 explain I don't use them.
- 12 O. You have looked at them?
- 13 A. In a cursory fashion, yes.
- 14 Q. In a cursory fashion; is that your
- 15 testimony?
- 16 A. I've never had any need or desire to, you
- 17 know, study those, audit those or analyze those.
- They are completely removed from my job
- 19 in doing LRSIC analyses.
- 20 Q. Okay, Mr. Palmer.
- 21 MR. PACE: Your Honor, we would ask that the
- 22 company authenticate City Palmer Cross Exhibit 20

- 1 as a true and accurate copy of part of the response
- 2 to SDR Data Request 001.
- 3 JUDGE MORAN: What do you mean by
- 4 "authenticate"?
- I am going to tell you as I look at this
- 6 data request, I have a problem already because the
- 7 data requested, which is, I believe, the questions
- 8 put to the company in this data request, continue
- 9 H, I. The response which is on the second page
- 10 goes to J and K. So there appears to be more of
- 11 the data request and -- there seems to be less of
- 12 the data request, more of the data response, that
- 13 this is not a complete copy of anything.
- 14 MR. PACE: That's true, your Honor.
- I am not purporting to say that this is
- 16 a complete copy, but what I am asking for
- 17 recognition of the fact is that the third page of
- 18 City Palmer Cross Exhibit 20 was provided by the
- 19 company in response to SDR 001, and I believe it's
- 20 Subpart E, monthly managerial reports providing
- 21 financial results of operations for each of the
- 22 past 12 months and each of the 8 subsequent months

- 1 as it becomes available.
- 2 JUDGE MORAN: So you are purporting to tell us
- 3 that Page 3 is part of the response of E?
- 4 MR. PACE: Correct.
- 5 JUDGE MORAN: Is it the only response of E?
- 6 MR. PACE: No.
- 7 JUDGE MORAN: Well, then it doesn't give us a
- 8 good and accurate trail of what is going on in
- 9 these data requests and these responses.
- 10 Does a complete version of this data
- 11 request and response exist?
- 12 MR. PACE: I am sure that there -- I shouldn't
- 13 say I am sure.
- 14 JUDGE MORAN: And does it possibly reflect who
- 15 prepared it?
- 16 MR. PACE: I don't know the answer to that
- 17 question. I assume --
- 18 JUDGE MORAN: You can't tell from here, and I
- 19 don't have a full copy from you. So...
- 20 MR. PACE: I guess the point is that this,
- 21 obviously, was a request sent to the company. The
- 22 company, obviously, responded to some extent.

- 1 We have attached a page which we believe
- 2 is part of that response.
- 3 If the hearing examiners would like the
- 4 full response to this question, as opposed to a
- 5 partial response to this question as an exhibit --
- 6 JUDGE MORAN: I think you have to do that. It's
- 7 unfair -- it raises too many questions when you put
- 8 in a partial document. It's the rule of
- 9 completeness.
- 10 MR. ANDERSON: I guess I have an objection, and
- 11 Mr. Pace is asking for this so-called
- 12 authentication to lay a foundation for putting this
- 13 into the record.
- We are here for the cross-examination of
- 15 Mr. Palmer on his testimony.
- I believe the testimony of Mr. Palmer
- 17 indicates he didn't rely on -- hasn't prepared it,
- 18 hasn't seen it, hasn't relied on it, it's not
- 19 relevant to Mr. Palmer's testimony. It's outside
- 20 the scope of his testimony. We received thousands
- 21 of data requests, and we provide thousands of
- 22 responses. We don't acknowledge by responding that

- 1 every single response is relevant in every stage of
- 2 the proceeding.
- 3 If GCI had questions for a witness who
- 4 was here who testified on depreciation expense,
- 5 perhaps it would have been relevant at that time.
- 6 I don't know.
- 7 But it's not relevant at this time.
- 8 JUDGE MORAN: I believe we agree that it's not
- 9 relevant however.
- 10 MR. PACE: I am sorry. I didn't hear that.
- 11 JUDGE MORAN: We believe it is not relevant in
- 12 terms of Mr. Palmer.
- 13 MR. PACE: Mr. Palmer does talk about
- 14 depreciation in his testimony.
- JUDGE MORAN: However he did, in fact, testify
- 16 that he did not prepare --
- 17 MR. PACE: I understand that.
- 18 JUDGE MORAN: -- this particular document, and
- 19 he did not rely on it.
- 20 Am I correct, Mr. Palmer, you did not
- 21 rely on this particular document?
- 22 THE WITNESS: In no way or fashion.

- 1 JUDGE MORAN: What we will have the company do
- 2 is provide a response to the hearing examiners as
- 3 to who, in fact, prepared this response.
- 4 MR. PACE: And just --
- 5 JUDGE MORAN: The City will provide a full copy
- 6 of the request to the response.
- 7 MR. PACE: My understanding is the full response
- 8 to this is quite voluminous and may not be entirely
- 9 appropriate to put all of this into the record, if
- 10 any of it goes into the record.
- We are concerned with, obviously, the
- 12 response to E which has at least 12 months of the
- 13 data that's shown on Page 3.
- 14 So I mean to the extent that we are
- 15 talking about following up on this, and I think it
- 16 might behoove us to narrow our scope to that.
- I mean, this data request goes way
- 18 beyond the depreciation issues which we are
- 19 interested in.
- 20 For instance, H talks about the labor
- 21 contact. I don't think at this point we want to be
- 22 talking about that.

- 1 JUDGE MORAN: Okay. I am sorry.
- 2 MR. PACE: So at this point the company is going
- 3 to find out who prepared this, and we are
- 4 specifically interested in Subpart E, and at that
- 5 point we'll take this issue --
- 6 JUDGE MORAN: Well, to the extent that whoever
- 7 prepared there is not -- has not appeared as a
- 8 witness yet, you'll be able to cross-examine that
- 9 particular witness on this.
- 10 MR. PACE: Your Honor, I think that some
- 11 latitude should be allowed.
- We have talked to Ameritech's counsel
- 13 about outstanding data requests and having them
- 14 admitted into the record as a late-filed exhibit.
- As counsel for Ameritech has said,
- 16 there's been thousands of data requests here.
- 17 Mr. Palmer attached depreciation
- 18 information to his testimony. I believe it was
- 19 responsible for us to assume that he would be
- 20 familiar with a data response that dealt with
- 21 depreciation of the company or generally understood
- 22 how depreciation worked. I think it would be

- 1 unfair for us not to get that exhibit in if it's a
- 2 true and accurate copy of the response to a data
- 3 request of how they calculate their depreciation.
- 4 JUDGE MORAN: The problem is it cannot go
- 5 through this witness. This was not relied on by
- 6 this witness, and this witness has not prepared it.
- 7 MR. PACE: But we've talked about, and this was
- 8 on the record earlier, about admitting responses to
- 9 data requests as late-filed exhibits. That's
- 10 something that Ameritech Illinois and GCI --
- 11 MR. ANDERSON: First of all --
- 12 JUDGE MORAN: Excuse me. And you could have
- 13 taken the opportunity to find out who in the world
- 14 prepared the responses to this prior to the
- 15 hearing.
- 16 MR. ANDERSON: I was only going to note that I
- 17 believe that this response would have been provided
- 18 possibly in the spring or early summer of 2000.
- 19 MR. PACE: But the fact --
- 20 MR. ANDERSON: SDR 001 is one of the first --
- 21 JUDGE MORAN: So you are saying it's been around
- 22 for a long time?

- 1 MR. PACE: Yeah, but the supplemental
- 2 surrebuttal was just filed. This was just filed
- 3 with this attachment, Schedule 3, Exhibit 10.3.
- 4 JUDGE MORAN: And you certainly can cross all
- 5 you want on that -- on those schedules.
- 6 MR. PACE: But I am going to the point that the
- 7 relevance of the SDR 001 with respect to Mr. Palmer
- 8 just became evident when he filed this supplemental
- 9 surrebuttal testimony a week before the hearing.
- 10 So I think in responding to what Mr. Anderson,
- 11 again, it's not that it's been around for eight
- 12 months. It's that it's become an issue only in the
- 13 last couple weeks.
- I don't think it would prejudice
- 15 Ameritech to have their actual data into the
- 16 record.
- 17 MR. ANDERSON: I just want to make one further
- 18 response, and then I won't respond further.
- 19 The issue of how depreciation is
- 20 calculated for a LRSIC study and how Mr. Palmer
- 21 calculated depreciations for a LRSIC study has been
- 22 an issue since Mr. Palmer presented his direct

- 1 testimony in this case.
- 2 The calculation of depreciation as a
- 3 particular issue was joined earlier then the
- 4 supplemental surrebuttal testimony. So to state
- 5 that the issue of the relevance of how depreciation
- 6 expense is calculated all of a sudden arose for the
- 7 first time in supplemental surrebuttal testimony I
- 8 believe is incorrect.
- 9 MR. PACE: I disagree. It's in response to
- 10 Mr. Dunkel's rebuttal testimony, as I believe, in
- 11 terms of the average reserve conditions. This is
- 12 what he first brought out in the supplemental
- 13 surrebuttal.
- 14 JUDGE MORAN: This cross exhibit is not coming
- 15 in with this witness, and Ameritech is instructed
- 16 to provide us the information and get the full data
- 17 request and response.
- Okay. Where are we at?
- 19 MR. PACE: I have additional cross.
- 20 JUDGE MORAN: You have additional cross?
- 21 Please proceed.
- 22 BY MR. PACE: Q. Okay. Sticking with Schedule 3,

- 1 Page 3 of Schedule 3 to Ameritech Illinois Exhibit
- 2 10.3, now, this schedule, among other things,
- 3 calculates an average reserve of \$100,000
- 4 investment that stays in service for ten years,
- 5 correct?
- 6 A. Correct.
- 7 Q. Now, this Schedule 3 calculates the average
- 8 investment to be \$50,000 over the life of the
- 9 plant, correct?
- 10 A. It's an average plant surviving over the
- 11 life of the plant.
- 12 Q. I'm sorry?
- 13 A. It's the average plant surviving over the
- 14 life of the plant.
- 15 Q. Now, does this average include all ten
- 16 investment figures shown?
- 17 A. That's correct.
- 18 Q. Now, about a third of the way down on Page
- 19 3 of Schedule 3, you have a number listed for
- 20 average reserve of \$18,182.
- 21 Do you see that number?
- 22 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. Now, is it correct that you got that number
- 2 by adding the numbers on the depreciation reserve
- 3 line all the way across and divided by 11?
- 4 Is that correct?
- 5 A. I believe the footnote average reserve says
- 6 it's -- average of depreciation reserve years 0
- 7 through year 10.
- 8 Q. So is the answer correct that you add the
- 9 numbers on the depreciation reserve line all the
- 10 way across and divided by 11?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. Okay. Now, in this calculation on Page 3
- 13 of Schedule 3, the numbers you displayed on that
- 14 depreciation reserve line included a zero at the
- 15 start and a zero at the end; is that correct?
- 16 A. That is correct.
- 17 Q. So by adding a zero at both ends, you have
- 18 two years on the average where the reserve was
- 19 zero, correct?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. So would it be fair to say that the average
- 22 investment includes 10 figures and the average

- 1 reserve includes 11 figures?
- 2 A. You know, I would like to verify what
- 3 the -- if the average plant surviving includes 10
- 4 or 11 figures. I'm looking for my calculator over
- 5 here.
- 6 JUDGE MORAN: I am sorry. You need a
- 7 calculator?
- 8 JUDGE CASEY: We'll go off the record.
- 9 (Discussion off the record.)
- 10 BY MR. PACE: Q. Do you want me to repeat the
- 11 question?
- 12 A. Yeah, you could if you want, but I think I
- 13 know the answer.
- 14 Q. Let me just repeat it.
- Is it true that the average investment
- 16 includes 10 figures and the average reserve
- 17 includes 11 figures on Schedule 3, Page 3, of
- 18 Ameritech Exhibit 10.3?
- 19 A. Yeah. This verified what I called the
- 20 average plant surviving is, you know, the numbers
- 21 of the plants surviving column divided by ten.
- 22 Q. Right, but I am asking for a comparison of

- 1 the two calculations.
- 2 A. The other one, like we talked about the
- 3 depreciation reserve, was dividing numbers by 11.
- 4 Q. By 11 figures?
- 5 A. Right.
- 6 Q. Okay. Okay. Move to another subject area.
- 7 Supplemental Surrebuttal Testimony, Page 13.
- 8 Proprietary version Line 21?
- 9 MR. ANDERSON: What was the reference again?
- I am sorry.
- 11 MR. PACE: Supplemental surrebuttal Ameritech
- 12 Illinois Exhibit 10.3, Page 13.
- JUDGE MORAN: Mr. Pace, can you give the
- 14 question so that for those --
- MR. PACE: Before I mention any numbers, I will
- 16 make sure.
- 17 MR. ANDERSON: Are you asking about the question
- 18 that begins on Line 3?
- 19 JUDGE MORAN: You've got to talk questions. You
- 20 have got to put in the questions.
- 21 MR. PACE: The question is, at Page 75 and 76 of
- 22 his rebuttal testimony, Mr. Dunkel discusses the

- 1 average depreciation reserve and life of
- 2 investments, that question.
- 3 MR. ANDERSON: Okay. Thank you.
- 4 JUDGE MORAN: Is there anything proprietary
- 5 here?
- 6 MR. ANDERSON: Not in that question and answer.
- 7 JUDGE MORAN: Okay. All right.
- 8 BY MR. PACE: Q. You say there, Mr. Palmer, isn't
- 9 it correct, that Mr. Dunkel's 50 percent scenario
- 10 also assumes that each count has a zero net salvage
- 11 value, Line 21?
- 12 A. Right.
- 13 Q. Now, isn't it correct that the example that
- 14 Mr. Dunkel presented in his testimony was for
- 15 buildings?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. Now, is it also correct that the
- 18 depreciation parameters that the FCC currently
- 19 utilizes for your company, for Ameritech Illinois,
- 20 in the intrastate jurisdiction has a zero future
- 21 net salvage for buildings?
- 22 A. I will accept that subject to check.

- 1 Q. Would it be also true that for buildings
- 2 that the parameters the ICC approved and the alt
- 3 reg order had a zero future net salvage for
- 4 buildings?
- 5 A. I will accept that subject to check.
- 6 Q. Now, would it also be correct that for
- 7 those accounts that had a net salvage different
- 8 than zero Mr. Dunkel did include the impact of the
- 9 net salvage in his calculation?
- 10 And I would refer you to Page 58 of
- 11 Mr. Dunkel's direct and Page 75 of Mr. Dunkel's
- 12 rebuttal.
- 13 JUDGE CASEY: Are you asking Mr. Palmer to
- 14 confirm whether or not something is contained in
- 15 Mr. Dunkel's testimony?
- 16 MR. PACE: Yes, taking issue with his
- 17 characterization in his supplemental testimony.
- 18 JUDGE MORAN: Do you have Mr. Dunkel's
- 19 testimony, Mr. Palmer?
- 20 THE WITNESS: Yes, I do, and I am on Page 58 of
- 21 his direct.
- 22 And what was the question?

- 1 BY MR. PACE: Q. Isn't it correct that for those
- 2 accounts that have a net salvage value different
- 3 than zero that Mr. Dunkel did include the impact of
- 4 the net salvage in his calculation?
- 5 MR. ANDERSON: Do you have a specific line
- 6 number to refer to in Mr. Dunkel's testimony?
- 7 MR. PACE: One second. Mr. Palmer, do you know
- 8 that answer without looking at his testimony?
- 9 A. I am looking at Page 58, and what I see on
- 10 Page 58 is a statement that says, for an account
- 11 which has zero net salvage for a building
- 12 account --
- JUDGE CASEY: Mr. Palmer, hold on.
- 14 Mr. Pace, can you direct the witness to
- 15 a specific spot in the testimony?
- 16 MR. PACE: If I could have a moment.
- Okay. I am going to refer you to --
- 18 actually it's an attachment to the direct which is
- 19 GCI Exhibit 8.10, and your copy, it might be 3.10
- 20 because it originally circulated with that 3.10,
- 21 Page 3 of 4.
- MR. ANDERSON: This is Schedule 8.10.

- 1 BY MR. PACE: Q. 8.10 attached to Mr. Dunkel's
- 2 direct testimony.
- 3 A. Okay. I have got that in front of me.
- 4 Q. Page 3. If you go over five columns, that
- 5 column is called Future Net Salvage, correct?
- 6 A. Correct.
- 7 Q. And if you go down that column for the
- 8 different accounts, you'll see numbers other than
- 9 zero, correct?
- 10 A. Correct.
- 11 Q. So isn't it correct that Mr. Dunkel did
- 12 include the impact of the net salvage in his
- 13 calculation when the net salvage was different than
- 14 zero?
- MR. ANDERSON: I am going to object to that
- 16 question because there is no foundation laid that
- 17 the particular schedule you are referring to
- 18 relates in any way to any adjustments that
- 19 Mr. Dunkel made to the LRSIC studies presented by
- 20 Mr. Palmer.
- 21 BY MR. PACE: Q. So Mr. -- let me withdraw that
- 22 question, and I will ask another question.

- 1 You would agree that the future net --
- 2 excuse me -- on GCI Exhibit 8.10, Page 3, on the
- 3 first column under Future Net Salvage, there are
- 4 numbers listed underneath that for each of the
- 5 accounts, and some of those numbers are different
- 6 than zero, correct?
- 7 MR. ANDERSON: I guess I am going to object.
- 8 This exhibit speaks for itself. It
- 9 presumably is described in Mr. Dunkel's testimony
- 10 and for whatever purpose it's used.
- 11 MR. PACE: I think that this is a foundation
- 12 question, your Honor. I think he can say whether
- 13 those numbers differ from zero.
- 14 JUDGE MORAN: Okay. Where are we at?
- JUDGE CASEY: Mr. Palmer, do the numbers say
- 16 something other than zero?
- 17 THE WITNESS: There is some zeros, and there's
- 18 some positive numbers, and there's some negative
- 19 numbers.
- 20 BY MR. PACE: Q. Okay. Now, didn't you say in
- 21 your supplemental surrebuttal that Mr. Dunkel did
- 22 not consider the impact of the net salvage value in

- 1 his calculation when the necessary salvage was
- 2 different than zero?
- MR. ANDERSON: Do you have a specific reference?
- 4 JUDGE MORAN: You are saying where?
- 5 MR. PACE: In his supplemental surrebuttal, Page
- 6 13, Line 21.
- 7 THE WITNESS: I think what I am saying there --
- 8 and this is repetitive with my rebuttal
- 9 testimony -- that the scenario that Mr. Dunkel put
- 10 forth in his direct testimony, which said that the
- 11 net investment is always 50 percent, only works in
- 12 the simplest of circumstances, and those
- 13 circumstances included where every asset in a class
- 14 of asset lives exactly as long as the average life
- 15 assumed for that entire class, and when the net
- 16 salvage is assumed to be zero and when -- you know,
- 17 you don't consider deferred taxes or any of that.
- I wasn't speaking to the specific
- 19 calculations he may or may not have performed.
- I was responding to the statement in his
- 21 direct testimony that Ameritech Illinois' reserve
- 22 estimates are too low because it should always be

- 1 50 percent.
- 2 BY MR. PACE: Q. Thank you, Mr. Palmer.
- 3 Another topic, Page 15 of your
- 4 supplemental surrebuttal, you talk about deferred
- 5 taxpayers' reserves, the impact?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Now, is it correct that in the early years
- 8 of investment, money effectively flows into the
- 9 taxpayers' reserve and, in later years, money flows
- 10 out of that taxpayers' reserve?
- 11 A. That's correct.
- 12 Q. So for a given piece of equipment, the
- 13 taxpayers' reserve will be a positive number
- 14 growing during the early years and from some later
- 15 years a tax reserve for that piece of equipment
- 16 would decline and ultimately be zero; is that
- 17 correct?
- 18 A. Yeah. It starts to decline when you start
- 19 to pay back the taxes previously deferred.
- 20 Q. And isn't it correct that the tax reserve
- 21 will never be negative?
- 22 A. I wouldn't think that it could go negative.

- 1 Q. Okay. And the tax reserve is a separate
- 2 reserve from the depreciation and amortization
- 3 reserve, correct?
- 4 A. That's correct.
- 5 Q. Another subject of questions, going to your
- 6 direct testimony, Page 28, you were asked there to
- 7 summarize the changes that you made to the
- 8 Ameritech LFAM (phonetic) since it's last
- 9 aggregate revenue test response, correct?
- 10 A. Correct.
- 11 Q. Now, in this testimony you are comparing
- 12 the LRSIC and other information that you are using
- 13 in this case to what was contained in the last
- 14 aggregate revenue test or ART that was filed,
- 15 correct?
- 16 A. Yeah, compared it to the LRSIC that was
- 17 used in the last revenue test, right?
- 18 Q. Now, and I was going to -- I am not sure if
- 19 this is proprietary or not.
- 20 Are those numbers proprietary on Page 28
- 21 of your direct, Line 10?
- MR. ANDERSON: Could I have a second please?

- 1 MR. PACE: The percent increases in the access
- 2 area cost.
- 3 MR. ANDERSON: Could we go off the record for
- 4 one second.
- 5 (Discussion off the record.)
- 6 JUDGE CASEY: Go back on the record.
- 7 BY MR. PACE: Q. Now, there on Line 10 of Page 28
- $8\,$  of your direct, Mr. Palmer, you say that LRS IC as
- 9 calculated for this proceeding indicates increases
- 10 over the LRSIC presented in the last ART or
- 11 aggregate revenue test of 54 percent, 34 percent
- 12 and 46 percent in access areas A, B and C
- 13 respectfully, correct?
- 14 A. Correct.
- 15 Q. Now, in these percentages you are
- 16 specifically referring to the network access LRSIC,
- 17 correct?
- 18 A. Correct.
- 19 Q. Now, in the ART that was filed at the time
- 20 you filed this testimony, that was the ART for the
- 21 year 1999 which I believe is characterized as the
- 22 year 2000 ART?

- 1 A. You said something about filed with the
- 2 testimony or attached to the testimony.
- 3 Q. I apologize. I didn't mean to imply that
- 4 you actually attached the ART.
- 5 A. The one I referred to here?
- 6 Q. Yes.
- 7 A. Yeah. I believe that would be the ART
- 8 filed in 2000, and the LRSICs that supported that
- 9 were probably prepared in '99.
- 10 Q. Okay. And I am going to show you a copy of
- 11 an ART filing to -- for identification.
- 12 At this point I am just going to give it
- 13 to counsel for Ameritech and the witness and the
- 14 hearing examiners, if I may, in case -- this says
- 15 "confidential document proprietary."
- 16 JUDGE MORAN: Okay. We'll be going in camera.
- 17 MR. PACE: And I am going to identify it as --
- 18 I believe it's City Palmer Cross Exhibit 21.
- 19 JUDGE MORAN: Excuse me. Is anybody in the room
- 20 that has not signed the confidentiality agreement?
- 21 Everybody has. Okay.
- 22 MR. ANDERSON: I guess there is one person who

```
1 may not have.
      MR. HARVEY: Mr. Reddick seems to be giving the
 3 sign that he has not.
      MR. REDDICK: I'll leave.
 5
      MR. ANDERSON: How did he get so lucky?
 6
                     (Whereupon, an in camera
 7
                     discussion was had.)
 8
 9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
```